

# APPENDIX A

## PCN Benchmarking Exercise - August 2010

Borough	Per hour issue rate on - street	Per hour issue rate CCTV	Provider	PCN increase / decline (%) over the last 12 months or other (see comments). Obtained from the LA	PCN decline (%) Figures from London Councils 2008/09 to 2009/10	Comments
Brent	0.94		Apcoa		-6.03%	A decline from 104k in 2008/09 to 97K in 2009/10.
Hackney	0.03	2.28	APCOA	-30.00%	-14.62%	
				-1.90%	13.44%	Saw a 1.9% decrease in PCN issue between 2008/09 and 2009/10 and a similar decrease is projected for 2010/11. However this can largely be attributed to the introduction of CCTV enforcement (saturating certain areas) part way through 2009/10, rather than a general trend. 10% up on moving traffic .
Redbridge	1.39		Apcoa			
Southark	0.70		Apcoa	-8.00%	-7.60%	
<b>Averages</b>	<b>0.77</b>	<b>2.28</b>		<b>-13.30%</b>	<b>-3.70%</b>	
Barking and Dagenham	1.40	4.20	In house	20.00%	7.80%	Increase of 20% however this was a low base from staffing issues.
Barnet			In house		-24.59%	
Croydon	1.93	3.50	In house	3.00%	3.08%	Increase by 3,513. An overall increase of 3%. Do not issue PCNs by CCTV.
Greenwich	1.75	N/A	In house		-14.34%	
Hammersmith & Fulham	1.40		In house	30.00%	18.11%	CCTV figure should be noted that it is only Bus lane PCNs and only for 6 hours per day.
Haringey	1.40	5.80	In house	-6.50%	-4.50%	
				4.00%	-6.94%	
Merton	1.75	6.75	In House			PCN is roughly the same as last year. Figures for CCTV are an average for the period February 10 to July 10. The TMA / economic climate.
Tower Hamlets	1.20	2.00	In house	1.20%	1.32%	
Transport for London			In house - Met police		-26.39%	
<b>Averages</b>	<b>1.55</b>	<b>4.45</b>		<b>8.62%</b>	<b>-5.16%</b>	
Hillingdon	1.04	1.50	Mouchel	0.00%	14.77%	PCN is roughly the same as last year. Figures for CCTV are an average for the period February 10 to July 10. The TMA / economic climate.
Newham	1.38	1.36	Mouchel	-8.10%	-0.46%	
Wandsworth	0.76	4.50	Mouchel	-9.00%	-20.28%	
<b>Averages</b>	<b>1.06</b>	<b>2.45</b>		<b>-5.70%</b>	<b>-1.99%</b>	
Bexley	0.80	0.80	NSL	-22.00%	-2.59%	New Contractor. Still bidding.
Camden	1.27	1.36	NSL	-9.50%	-4.75%	
					-26.41%	CCTV based on average PCN's posted. PNC based on comparison of last FY with curent FY. There is an improvement.
Ealing	1.04	3.00	NSL			
Enfield	0.76		NSL	-15.00%	-15.25%	Do not issue PCN's by CCTV.
Islington	0.79	1.03	NSL	-11.00%	36.19%	
Kensington & Chelsea	1.02	N/A	NSL	0.20%	-16.18%	CCTV enforcing 36 hours per week. PCN decline due to changes in protocols.
Kingston Upon Thames	0.70	9.70	NSL	-9.00%	-8.99%	
Lambeth	0.70	1.30	NSL	-15.00%	4.05%	Over the last 12-months, PCN issue has fluctuated on a monthly basis due to various factors, (PCN variance between <> issue rates indicates 3.56% sway in period)
Lewisham	0.90		NSL	-11.00%	11.06%	
					-7.34%	
Richmond Upon Thames	N/A		NSL			PCN decline for last years figures. Fewer vehicles contravening. There has been a gradual decline. CCTV figures combine both areas of the CCTV (The hours of those monitoring the cameras + hours of those creating PCN's)
	1.20	1.60		-20.00%	2.02%	
Waltham Forest			NSL			Currently looking into the PCN levels. Since the beginning of this year there has been a slow decline in PCN's. Had a software change therefore can only provide last years PCN figures.
Westminster	0.85	1.09	NSL	-20.00%	-30.42%	
<b>Averages</b>	<b>0.91</b>	<b>2.49</b>		<b>-13.23%</b>	<b>-4.88%</b>	
Bromley	1.25		Vinci Park		-5.21%	
	0.80	6.00		-3.00%	18.52%	
City of London			Vinci Park			
Harrow					-9.00%	
Havering					-7.29%	
Hounslow					-8.58%	
Sutton					-7.53%	
<b>Averages</b>	<b>1.03</b>	<b>6.00</b>		<b>-3.00%</b>	<b>-3.18%</b>	
<b>Total Averages</b>	<b>1.06</b>	<b>3.53</b>		<b>-5.32%</b>	<b>-3.78%</b>	
<b>Inner London Average</b>	<b>0.95</b>	<b>2.37</b>		<b>-9%</b>	<b>1%</b>	

## APPENDIX B

### Comparison

### Parking Enforcement Service Delivery Costs 2007/08

	Barnet	Brent	Camden	Enfield	Haringey	Hillingdon
	In-house	Contract	Contract	Contract	In-house	Contract
<b>1. The enforcement operation for parking, Bus Lane and Moving traffic offences:(The IT system costs are separate)</b>		Removals adjustment - £500,000	Improvement cost adjs - £2.5m Removals - £1	Including IT costs and informal reps Removals adjustment - £500,000	O/head adjustment + £800,000 removals - £780,000	Including IT costs
<b>Total</b>	£3,198,050	£2,810,200	£10,285,400	£3,228,000	£4,567,000	£1,930,000
Apparent Operation cost comparison per PCN	£20	£25	£18	£31	£23	£23
<b>Apparent Operation and system cost comparison per PCN</b>	<b>£22.06</b>	<b>£30.00</b>	<b>£27.05</b>	<b>£31.04</b>	<b>£28.91</b>	<b>£23.17</b>
<b>2. Process and Debt recovery.</b>	O/head adjustment + £300,000	Including management costs		Including management costs	O/head adjustment + £700,000	Including management costs O/head adjustment + £800,000
<b>Total</b>	£1,680,340	£1,164,400	£3,451,370	£1,787,000	£1,743,285	£1,602,932
Apparent process cost comparison per PCN	£11	£10	£6	£17	£9	£19
<b>Apparent process plus management cost comparison per PCN</b>	<b>£12.81</b>	<b>£10.24</b>	<b>£7.93</b>	<b>£17.18</b>	<b>£10.97</b>	<b>£19.24</b>
<b>3. IT Systems</b>						
All equipment, maintenance, licences etc. Any specific system support staff but not corporate IT support.	£261,820	£600,000	£5,000,000	£0	£1,165,000	£0
<b>4. Management and Performance Reporting</b>	O/head adjustment + £100,000				O/head adjustment + £260,000	
Staff costs (including overheads)	£329,350	£0	£1,030,846	£0	£432,000	£0
<b>Overall Total</b>	<b>£5,469,560</b>	<b>£4,574,600</b>	<b>£19,767,616</b>	<b>£5,015,000</b>	<b>£7,907,285</b>	<b>£3,532,932</b>
Apparent overall cost comparison per PCN	£34.88	£40.25	£34.99	£48.22	£39.89	£42.42

<b>Summary costs/Volume 2007/08</b>	Barnet	Brent	Camden	Enfield	Haringey	Hillingdon
	In-house	Contract	Contract	Contract	In-house	Contract
PCN income	£6,763,079	£7,400,000	£27,189,000	£5,377,208	£7,255,000	£3,829,002
Charge income	£4,228,800	£3,300,000	£17,430,000	£1,491,020	£3,253,000	£0
<b>Total income</b>	<b>£10,991,879</b>	<b>£10,700,000</b>	<b>£44,619,000</b>	<b>£6,868,228</b>	<b>£10,508,000</b>	<b>£3,829,002</b>
<b>Apparent Expenditure</b>	<b>£5,469,560</b>	<b>£4,574,600</b>	<b>£19,767,616</b>	<b>£5,015,000</b>	<b>£7,907,285</b>	<b>£3,532,932</b>
<b>Bad debt, removals, clamping, improvements adjustment</b>	<b>£350,000</b>	<b>£1,100,000</b>	<b>£3,500,000</b>	<b>£1,378,000</b>	<b>£780,000</b>	<b>£200,000</b>
<b>Adjusted apparent expenditure</b>	<b>£5,819,560</b>	<b>£5,674,600</b>	<b>£23,267,616</b>	<b>£6,393,000</b>	<b>£8,687,285</b>	<b>£3,732,932</b>
<b>Apparent surplus</b>	<b>£5,172,319</b>	<b>£5,025,400</b>	<b>£21,351,384</b>	<b>£475,228</b>	<b>£1,820,715</b>	<b>£96,070</b>
<b>Published Expenditure</b>	<b>£5,850,879</b>	<b>£5,700,000</b>	<b>£23,308,000</b>	<b>£6,361,681</b>	<b>£8,681,000</b>	<b>£3,729,500</b>
Published cost comparison per PCN	£37.31	£50.15	£41.25	£61.17	£43.79	£44.78
<b>Published surplus</b>	<b>£5,141,000</b>	<b>£5,000,000</b>	<b>£21,311,000</b>	<b>£506,547</b>	<b>£1,827,000</b>	<b>£99,502</b>
<b>Expenditure difference (Published minus Apparent)</b>	<b>£31,319</b>	<b>£25,400</b>	<b>£40,384</b>	<b>-£31,319</b>	<b>-£6,285</b>	<b>-£3,432</b>
Possible explanation	Overhead for process staff and management adjusted. Design £350,000?	Signs/lines (Wembley) & removal/pound? Overheads look reasonable.	Close enough	Close enough	Added central overheads	Overhead cost for process staff adjusted. Improvements £200,000?
Number CEO PCN's	115006	102368	428,000	56,862	116512	56426
Number camera/CCTV PCN's	41819	11290	137,000	47138	81726	26865
<b>Total PCN's issued</b>	<b>156825</b>	<b>113658</b>	<b>565000</b>	<b>104000</b>	<b>198238</b>	<b>83291</b>
<b>Recovery rate</b>	<b>72%</b>	<b>66%</b>	<b>72%</b>	<b>66%</b>	<b>64%</b>	<b>65%</b>

<b>Other useful information</b>						
Length of Highway (including TLRN & motorways)	790.80	492.70	287.50	662.20	363.10	778.10
Published cost per KM	£7,398.68	£11,568.91	£81,071.30	£9,606.89	£23,908.01	£4,793.09
Number of ticket machines	?	600	967	219	287	114

#### Performance satisfaction

Very Happy
Happy
Unhappy

Very efficient	Good contract	Cost too high	Low cost
----------------	---------------	---------------	----------

## APPENDIX B

### Barnet Parking Enforcement Service Delivery Costs 2007/08

Ref	Item	No. Staff	Staff cost inc overheads £	Equipment or provider cost £	Notes
<b>1.0</b>	<b>The enforcement operation for parking, Bus Lane and Moving traffic offences:(The IT system costs are separate)</b>				
<b>1.1</b>	Enforcement by CEO's: The process from walking the street to the issue of the Penalty Charge Notice. This excludes dealing with initial challenges (informal representations) Costs for staff time (including overheads). Equipment costs such as vehicles, uniforms, handheld devices, cameras, stationery, ticket rolls etc.	66	2128810	0	
<b>1.2</b>	Enforcement by Mobile or fixed cameras: The process from setting up, retrieving data and issuing PCN by post which is regarded as the NTO. Costs for staff (including overheads). Equipment costs such as vehicles, uniforms, handheld devices, cameras, stationery, ticket rolls etc.				Included in 1.1
<b>1.3</b>	Enforcement by CCTV: The process from viewing cameras, capturing the offence and issuing the PCN by post which is regarded as the NTO. Costs for staff time (including overheads) and equipment.				Included in 1.1
<b>1.4</b>	The issuing of permits either paper or electronic, visitor tickets, suspensions etc. and anything else associated with the parking shop interface. Costs for staff time (including overheads) such as premises. Equipment (stationery, web-services etc.)	7	195890		Equipment costs included in 2.0
<b>1.5</b>	Receipt of payments for PCN's or other charges by any means. Cost for staff time (including overheads), card services etc. and/or contract costs	3	80120	173500	Does not include managers and seniors who do budget monitoring and predictions – includes atp and web payments
<b>1.6</b>	Cash collection. Costs for staff time (including overheads). Equipment vehicles uniforms etc. and/or contract cost	7	214360		Includes full cash collection service
<b>1.7</b>	Ticket Machine maintenance: Staff cost, parts and vehicles	3	103560	154670	
<b>1.8</b>	Signs and lines maintenance: Staff cost. Contract supply and install cost	2	74140	73000	
<b>1.9</b>	Clamping	0	0	0	
<b>1.10</b>	Removal and pound storage	0	0	0	
	<b>Total</b>	<b>88</b>	<b>2796880</b>	<b>401170</b>	
<b>2.0</b>	<b>Process and Debt recovery.</b>				
<b>2.1</b>	Informal/Formal representations and adjudication. All staff costs (including overheads) and any equipment stationery etc. for the following: Consider and cancel PCN or issue Notice of Rejection, adjudication support and referrals back to the Council and issue Charge Certificate	21	472,490	0	Everything from enforcement through to recovery action. Have included staff up to reps stage and IT costs. Note printing costs is all printing of all notices as this cannot be broken down. Also includes all call centre staff and complaints handling. Note reps manger and seniors included in these costs – however they also work on adjudications, all calls and complaints. Includes all scanning and post team costs and postage. Includes training OH costs etc as well as any equipment costs – this cannot be broken down by stage
<b>2.2</b>	Debt Recovery/Court Process: All staff costs (including overheads) ) and any equipment stationery etc. for the following: Register Debt and administer Order for Recovery, apply for Warrant and serve through certified Bailiff.	5	154910	280450	Includes manager, senior and debt staff. Costs included in line 2.0 except debt reg and adjudications costs – all TEC costs
	<b>Total</b>	<b>26</b>	<b>1099890</b>	<b>280450</b>	
<b>3.0</b>	<b>IT Systems</b>				
<b>3.1</b>	All equipment, maintenance, licences etc. Any specific system support staff but not corporate IT support.	1	35010	226810	Includes all software, hardware and maintenance
<b>4.0</b>	<b>Management and Performance Reporting</b>				
<b>4.1</b>	Staff costs (including overheads)	4	229350	0	Costs included elsewhere
	<b>Overall Totals</b>	<b>119</b>	<b>4161130</b>	<b>908430</b>	
	<b>Combined Total</b>			<b>5069560</b>	

Summary costs/Volume 2007/08	Value £	Volume No.
PCN income	6763079	Includes CCTV and CEO
Charge income	4228800	Includes permits and P&D
<b>Total income</b>	<b>10991879</b>	
<b>Published Operation Expenditure</b>	<b>5850879</b>	
<b>Surplus</b>	<b>5141000</b>	Does not exclude capital debt charge
Number CEO PCN's		115006
Number camera/CCTV PCN's		41819
<b>Total PCN's issued</b>		<b>156825</b>
<b>Recovery rate</b>	<b>72%</b>	

Other useful information	Quantity
Length of Highway on KM (Source 1)	790.80
Number CPZ's	28
Number of ticket machines	?
Number of car parks	

Level of satisfaction with service quality

Very efficient. Happy with performance

Source 1: Department for Transport Roads major roads database  
Road length by Authority 2007

## APPENDIX B

### Brent Parking Enforcement Service Delivery Costs 2007/08

Ref	Item	No. Staff	Staff cost inc overheads £	Equipment or provider cost £	Notes
1.0	<b>The enforcement operation for parking, Bus Lane and Moving traffic offences:(The IT system costs are separate)</b>				Contract with APCOA is based on fixed costs (hours requested etc) and variable (% fee for each successful PCN and reduction/penalty for each unsuccessful PCN). On average 8 to 9 thousand deployed hours a month.
1.1	Enforcement by CEO's: The process from walking the street to the issue of the Penalty Charge Notice. This excludes dealing with initial challenges (informal representations) Costs for staff time (including overheads). Equipment costs such as vehicles, uniforms, handheld devices, cameras, stationery, ticket rolls etc.			3,300,000	This is the total cost of the contract including everything, parking enforcement, notice processing, meter first line meter maintenance, cash collection, provision of 3 parking shops, issuing permits etc. Control room is manned by the contractor under the Enforcement contract but it is owned by the Council.
1.2	Enforcement by Mobile or fixed cameras: The process from setting up, retrieving data and issuing PCN by post which is regarded as the NTO. Costs for staff (including overheads). Equipment costs such as vehicles, uniforms, handheld devices, cameras, stationery, ticket rolls etc.				Included in 1.1
1.3	Enforcement by CCTV: The process from viewing cameras, capturing the offence and issuing the PCN by post which is regarded as the NTO. Costs for staff time (including overheads) and equipment.				Included in 1.1
1.4	The issuing of permits either paper or electronic, visitor tickets, suspensions etc. and anything else associated with the parking shop interface. Costs for staff time (including overheads) such as premises. Equipment (stationery, web-services etc.)				Included in 1.1
1.5	Receipt of payments for PCN's or other charges by any means. Cost for staff time (including overheads), card services etc. and/or contract costs				Included in 1.1
1.6	Cash collection. Costs for staff time (including overheads). Equipment vehicles uniforms etc. and/or contract cost				Included in 1.1
1.7	Ticket Machine maintenance: Staff cost, parts and vehicles			10,200	
1.8	Signs and lines maintenance: Staff cost. Contract supply and install cost				?
1.9	Clamping				N/A
1.10	Removal and pound storage				
	<b>Total</b>	0	0	3310200	
2.0	<b>Process and Debt recovery.</b>				NTO reps and appeal to Adjudicator are in houses, debt reg done by contractor and warrants executed by bailiff
2.1	Informal/Formal representations and adjudication. All staff costs (including overheads) and any equipment stationery etc. for the following: Consider and cancel PCN or issue Notice of Rejection, adjudication support and referrals back to the Council and issue Charge Certificate	15	1,022,400		Manager (PO9), Dep Manager(PO6), 2 monitors(SO1), 2 team leaders(SO2), 9 appeals officers(S6) and an admin(S3). Assumed salary
	Debt Recovery/Court Process: All staff costs (including overheads) ) and any equipment stationery etc. for the following: Register Debt and administer Order for Recovery, apply for Warrant and serve through certified Bailiff.			142,000	Staff costs included in 1.1. Debt reg assumed 25% @ £5
	<b>Total</b>	15	1022400	142000	
3.0	<b>IT Systems</b>				
3.1	All equipment, maintenance, licences etc. Any specific system support staff but not corporate IT support.	0		600,000	Separate contract but with APCOA
4.0	<b>Management and Performance Reporting</b>				
4.1	Staff costs (including overheads)	0		0	Included in 2.1
	<b>Overall Totals</b>	30	1,022,400	4,052,200	
	<b>Combined Total</b>			5,074,600	

Summary costs/Volume 2007/08	Value £	Volume No.	Notes
PCN income	7400000		
Charge income	3300000		
<b>Total income</b>	<b>10700000</b>		
<b>Published Operation Expenditure</b>	<b>5,700,000</b>		
<b>Surplus</b>	<b>5000000</b>		
Number CEO PCN's		102368	
Number camera/CCTV PCN's		11290	
<b>Total PCN's issued</b>		<b>113658</b>	
<b>Recovery rate</b>	66%		

Other useful information	Quantity	Notes
Length of Highway on KM (Source 1)	492.70	Length including Motorways, Trunk & TLRN
Number CPZ's	29	
Number of ticket machines	600	
Number of car parks	10	

Level of satisfaction with service quality

Very happy with cost and quality. Good contract and KPI's

Source 1: Department for Transport Roads major roads database  
Road length by Authority 2007

## APPENDIX B

### Camden Parking Enforcement Service Delivery Costs 2007/08

Ref	Item	No. Staff	Staff cost inc overheads £	Equipment or provider cost £	Notes
1.0	<b>The enforcement operation for parking, Bus Lane and Moving traffic offences:(The IT system costs are separate)</b>				Total of 5 contracts with NCP
1.1	Enforcement by CEO's: The process from walking the street to the issue of the Penalty Charge Notice. This excludes dealing with initial challenges (informal representations) . Costs for staff time (including overheads). Equipment costs such as vehicles, uniforms, handheld devices, cameras, stationery, ticket rolls etc.			6,000,000	North of Euston Rd £4m. South of Euston Rd £2m
1.2	Enforcement by Mobile or fixed cameras: The process from setting up, retrieving data and issuing PCN by post which is regarded as the NTO. Costs for staff (including overheads). Equipment costs such as vehicles, uniforms, handheld devices, cameras, stationery, ticket rolls etc.				Included in 1.1 or 1.3
1.3	Enforcement by CCTV: The process from viewing cameras, capturing the offence and issuing the PCN by post which is regarded as the NTO. Costs for staff time (including overheads) and equipment.			2,000,000	
1.4	The issuing of permits either paper or electronic, visitor tickets, suspensions etc. and anything else associated with the parking shop interface. Costs for staff time (including overheads) such as premises. Equipment (stationery, web-services etc.)	22	1,385,400	400,000	Permits total staff 19 (1x PO5; 1x PO3 and 17x SO1) + 3 Suspension staff (3x Scale 6). Parking shop contract (£400,000). Electronic permits contract (£200,000)
1.5	Receipt of payments for PCN's or other charges by any means. Cost for staff time (including overheads), card services etc. and/or contract costs				Included in 1.6
1.6	Cash collection. Costs for staff time (including overheads). Equipment vehicles uniforms etc. and/or contract cost		500,000		Cash collection is carried out in-house. The cost is approximately £500,000 pa for collection and counting and banking. This includes all the P&D machines, Environment Locals, car parks, car pound etc.
1.7	Ticket Machine maintenance: Staff cost, parts and vehicles	2			In - house
1.8	Signs and lines maintenance: Staff cost. Contract supply and install cost			2,500,000	Parking signs and markings - approx £500k per year but extra £2.5m to ensure all in accordance with TRO's
1.9	Clamping			1,000,000	
1.10	Removal and pound storage				Included in 1.9
	<b>Total</b>	24	1,885,400	11,900,000	
2.0	<b>Process and Debt recovery.</b>				
2.1	Informal/Formal representations and adjudication. All staff costs (including overheads) and any equipment stationery etc. for the following: Consider and cancel PCN or issue Notice of Rejection, adjudication support and referrals back to the Council and issue Charge Certificate	45.5	2,481,370		Notice to owner / Reps and charge certificates 35.5 staff (31.5x scale 6, 4x scale 4). Adjudication officers 5 staff (5x SO1) Also, 5 admin support officers (5x scale 3)
	Debt Recovery/Court Process: All staff costs (including overheads) ) and any equipment stationery etc. for the following: Register Debt and administer Order for Recovery, apply for Warrant and serve through certified Bailiff.	6	540,000	430,000	Debt recovery. 6 officers approx (£270k per annum + O/H cost to register debt?) - £270k purely staff costs - cost to register debt around £430k per annum
	<b>Total</b>	51.5	3,021,370	430,000	
3.0	<b>IT Systems</b>				
3.1	All equipment, maintenance, licences etc. Any specific system support staff but not corporate IT support.	0		5,000,000	Systems; back-office and equipment (handhelds etc) provided to contractor. Use Mouchel Traffic Support – value approx £500k per year
4.0	<b>Management and Performance Reporting</b>				
4.1	Staff costs (including overheads)	6	430,846	600,000	North Senior Contract Manager (PO4) , South Senior Contract Manager (PO3) and four Contract Compliance Officers (SO2) Total cost £191,805 per annum + O/H's. On off chang management cost in 2008 of £600,000
	<b>Overall Totals</b>	81.5	5,337,616	17,930,000	
	<b>Combined Total</b>			<b>23,267,616</b>	

Summary costs/Volume 2007/08	Value £	Volume No.	Notes
PCN income	27,189,000		
Charge income	17,430,000		
<b>Total income</b>	<b>44,619,000</b>		
<b>Published Operation Expenditure</b>	<b>23,308,000</b>		
<b>Surplus</b>	<b>21,311,000</b>		
Number CEO PCN's		428,000	
Number camera/CCTV PCN's		137,000	
<b>Total PCN's issued</b>		565,000	
<b>Recovery rate</b>	72%		

Other useful information	Quantity	Notes
Length of Highway on KM (Source 1)	287.50	Length including Motorways, Trunk & TLRN
Number CPZ's		
Number of ticket machines	967	925 P&D machines, and 42 parking meters.
Number of car parks		

Level of satisfaction with service quality

Very unhappy with cost and quality post April 2008

Source 1: Department for Transport Roads major roads database  
Road length by Authority 2007

## APPENDIX B

### Enfield Parking Enforcement Service Delivery Costs 2007/08

Ref	Item	No. Staff	Staff cost inc overheads £	Equipment or provider cost £	Notes
1.0	<b>The enforcement operation for parking, Bus Lane and Moving traffic offences:(The IT system costs are separate)</b>				Contract with NCP
1.1	Enforcement by CEO's: The process from walking the street to the issue of the Notice to Owner (NTO) so this includes dealing with initial challenges (informal representations) Costs for staff time (including overheads). Equipment costs such as vehicles, uniforms, handheld devices, cameras, stationery, ticket rolls etc.			3000000	Enforcement contract. NCP 7am to 7pm Mon to Sat. Cover all on street CEO's, Smart cars, cameras, tow away (no clamping), operate pound (owned by Enfield), markings maintenance, supply and maintenance of Mouchel IPS system and all other equipment, parking shop, issue permits, collect payments, informal reps and notice to owners for CEO issued PCN's. Cost £3m per year
1.2	Enforcement by Mobile or fixed cameras: The process from setting up, retrieving data and issuing PCN by post which is regarded as the NTO. Costs for staff (including overheads). Equipment costs such as vehicles, uniforms, handheld devices, cameras, stationery, ticket rolls etc.				Included in 1.1
1.3	Enforcement by CCTV: The process from viewing cameras, capturing the offence and issuing the PCN by post which is regarded as the NTO. Costs for staff time (including overheads) and equipment.			285000	Separate contract with Legion
1.4	The issuing of permits either paper or electronic, visitor tickets, suspensions etc. and anything else associated with the parking shop interface. Costs for staff time (including overheads) such as premises. Equipment (stationery, web-services etc.)				Included in 1.1
1.5	Receipt of payments for PCN's or other charges by any means. Cost for staff time (including overheads), card services etc. and/or contract costs				Included in 1.1
1.6	Cash collection. Costs for staff time (including overheads). Equipment vehicles uniforms etc. and/or contract cost			100000	
1.7	Ticket Machine maintenance: Staff cost, parts and vehicles			25000	£15681 on spare parts and tickets spend around £9k on two vehicles.
1.8	Signs and lines maintenance: Staff cost. Contract supply and install cost				
1.9	Clamping				N/A
1.10	Removal and pound storage			318000	
	<b>Total</b>	0	0	3728000	
2.0	<b>Process and Debt recovery.</b>				
2.1	Formal representations and adjudication. All staff costs (including overheads) and any equipment stationery etc. for the following: Consider and cancel PCN or issue Notice of Rejection, adjudication support and referrals back to the Council and issue Charge Certificate	28	1,548,000	114000	Formal reps through to warrant. Employ bailiffs. Total staff 28 of which 3 agency. Direct cost £860,000 + O/H's Agency £50,000. Specific accommodation cost for processing £64,000
2.2	Debt Recovery/Court Process: All staff costs (including overheads) ) and any equipment stationery etc. for the following: Register Debt and administer Order for Recovery, apply for Warrant and serve through certified Bailiff.			125,000	Staff costs included in 2.1. Debt reg, assumed 25% @ £5
	<b>Total</b>	28	1548000	239000	
3.0	<b>IT Systems</b>				
3.1	All equipment, maintenance, licences etc. Any specific system support staff but not corporate IT support.	0		0	Included in 1.1
4.0	<b>Management and Performance Reporting</b>				
4.1	Staff costs (including overheads)	0		0	Included in 2.1
	<b>Overall Totals</b>	28	1548000	3967000	
	<b>Combined Total</b>			<b>5515000</b>	

Summary costs/Volume 2007/08	Cost £	Volume No.	Notes
PCN income	5377208		
Charge income	1491020		
<b>Total income</b>	6868228		
<b>Published Operation Expenditure</b>	6361681		
<b>Surplus</b>	506547		
Number CEO PCN's		56,862	
Number camera/CCTV PCN's		47138	
<b>Total PCN's issued</b>		104000	
<b>Recovery rate</b>	66%		

Other useful information	Quantity	Notes
Length of Highway on KM (Source 1)	662.20	Length including Motorways, Trunk & TLRN
Number CPZ's		
Number of ticket machines	219	
Number of car parks		

Level of satisfaction with service quality

Happy with performance

Source 1: Department for Transport Roads major roads database  
Road length by Authority 2007

## APPENDIX B

### Haringey Parking Enforcement Service Delivery Costs 2007/08

Ref	Item	No. Staff	Staff cost inc overheads £	Equipment or provider cost £	Notes
1.0	<b>The enforcement operation for parking, Bus Lane and Moving traffic offences:(The IT system costs are separate)</b>				
1.1	Enforcement by CEO's: The process from walking the street to the issue of the Penalty Charge Notice. This excludes dealing with initial challenges (informal representations) Costs for staff time (including overheads). Equipment costs such as vehicles, uniforms, handheld devices, cameras, stationery, ticket rolls etc.	73	1800000	107000	64 CEO's plus 9 supervisors. CEO overheads includes uniforms, ticket rolls, travel etc. CEO's also report abandoned vehicles and missing signs/markings but not other highway defects.
1.2	Enforcement by Mobile or fixed cameras: The process from setting up, retrieving data and issuing PCN by post which is regarded as the NTO. Costs for staff (including overheads). Equipment costs such as vehicles, uniforms, handheld devices, cameras, stationery, ticket rolls etc.	19	436000		
1.3	Enforcement by CCTV: The process from viewing cameras, capturing the offence and issuing the PCN by post which is regarded as the NTO. Costs for staff time (including overheads) and equipment.				Included in 1.2
1.4	The issuing of permits either paper or electronic, visitor tickets, suspensions etc. and anything else associated with the parking shop interface. Costs for staff time (including overheads) such as premises. Equipment (stationery, web-services etc.)			723000	Corporate finance charges
1.5	Receipt of payments for PCN's or other charges by any means. Cost for staff time (including overheads), card services etc. and/or contract costs		174000	158000	Corporate finance charges. Cobalt contract
1.6	Cash collection. Costs for staff time (including overheads). Equipment vehicles uniforms etc. and/or contract cost			94000	CSS
1.7	Ticket Machine maintenance: Staff cost, parts and vehicles	3	103000	25000	In-house. Parkeon contract
1.8	Signs and lines maintenance: Staff cost. Contract supply and install cost	2	77000	70000	
1.9	Clamping				N/A
1.10	Removal and pound storage			780000	
	<b>Total</b>	<b>97</b>	<b>2590000</b>	<b>1957000</b>	
2.0	<b>Process and Debt recovery.</b>				
2.1	Informal/Formal representations and adjudication. All staff costs (including overheads) and any equipment stationery etc. for the following: Consider and cancel PCN or issue Notice of Rejection, adjudication support and referrals back to the Council and issue Charge Certificate	23	677,000		Split of all reps resource: Informal rep £167k(25%), Formal £420k(62%), Adjudication £90k(13%)
	Debt Recovery/Court Process: All staff costs (including overheads) ) and any equipment stationery etc. for the following: Register Debt and administer Order for Recovery, apply for Warrant and serve through certified Bailiff.	3	130000	236285	07/08 Debt: - 47,257 cases registered @ £5.
	<b>Total</b>	<b>26</b>	<b>807000</b>	<b>236285</b>	
3.0	<b>IT Systems</b>				
3.1	All equipment, maintenance, licences etc. Any specific system support staff but not corporate IT support.	0	1059000	106000	Corporate charges. Siemens contract
4.0	<b>Management and Performance Reporting</b>				
4.1	Staff costs (including overheads)	4.5	172000	0	
	<b>Overall Totals</b>	<b>127.5</b>	<b>4628000</b>	<b>2299285</b>	
	<b>Combined total</b>			<b>6927285</b>	

Summary costs/Volume 2007/08	Value £	Volume No.	Notes
PCN income	7255000		
Charge income	3253000		
<b>Total income</b>	<b>10508000</b>		
<b>Published Operation Expenditure</b>	<b>8681000</b>		
<b>Surplus</b>	<b>1827000</b>		
Number CEO PCN's		116512	
Number camera/CCTV PCN's		81726	
<b>Total PCN's issued</b>		<b>198238</b>	
<b>Recovery rate</b>	<b>64%</b>		

Other useful information	Quantity	Notes
Length of Highway on KM (Source 1)	363.10	Length including Motorways, Trunk & TLRN
Number CPZ's		
Number of ticket machines	287	
Number of car parks		

Level of satisfaction with service quality

Happy with performance. Good records

Source 1: Department for Transport Roads major roads database  
Road length by Authority 2007

## APPENDIX B

### Hillingdon Parking Enforcement Service Delivery Costs 2007/08

		No. Staff	Staff cost inc overheads £	Equipment or provider cost £	Notes
1.0	<b>The enforcement operation for parking, Bus Lane and Moving traffic offences:(The IT system costs are separate)</b>				The contract with Mouchel is 3years extendable by a further 2 years. Mouchel's contract includes all on-and off-street enforcement costs and the provision/maintenance of the ICT system. They do not undertake consideration of any challenges or appeals
1.1	Enforcement by CEO's: The process from walking the street to the issue of the Penalty Charge Notice. This excludes dealing with initial challenges (informal representations) Costs for staff time (including overheads). Equipment costs such as vehicles, uniforms, handheld devices, cameras, stationery, ticket rolls etc.			1,800,000	Cost 1.8m per year based on 72,000 hours. Everything up to but not including informal reps. Note contract cost probably less than it should be as first Mouchel contract of this type.
1.2	Enforcement by Mobile or fixed cameras: The process from setting up, retrieving data and issuing PCN by post which is regarded as the NTO. Costs for staff (including overheads). Equipment costs such as vehicles, uniforms, handheld devices, cameras, stationery, ticket rolls etc.				Included in 1.1
1.3	Enforcement by CCTV: The process from viewing cameras, capturing the offence and issuing the PCN by post which is regarded as the NTO. Costs for staff time (including overheads) and equipment.				Included in 1.1
1.4	The issuing of permits either paper or electronic, visitor tickets, suspensions etc. and anything else associated with the parking shop interface. Costs for staff time (including overheads) such as premises. Equipment (stationery, web-services etc.)				Included in 1.1
1.5	Receipt of payments for PCN's or other charges by any means. Cost for staff time (including overheads), card services etc. and/or contract costs				Included in 1.1
1.6	Cash collection. Costs for staff time (including overheads). Equipment vehicles uniforms etc. and/or contract cost		80,000		Staff and vehicles
1.7	Ticket Machine maintenance: Staff cost, parts and vehicles				Included in 1.6
1.8	Signs and lines maintenance: Staff cost. Contract supply and install cost			50,000	
1.9	Clamping				No clamping
1.10	Removal and pound storage				
	<b>Total</b>	0	80000	1850000	
2.0	<b>Process and Debt recovery.</b>				
2.1	Informal/Formal representations and adjudication. All staff costs (including overheads) and any equipment stationery etc. for the following: Consider and cancel PCN or issue Notice of Rejection, adjudication support and referrals back to the Council and issue Charge Certificate	25	702,932		Staff totals £535,213 (excluding central and other operational costs). 25 staff. These costs include challenges (informal reps) and everything up to Notice to Owner. For 2007/8 the overheads (which include central overheads as well as operational costs like printing, etc) were £167,719.
	Debt Recovery/Court Process: All staff costs (including overheads) ) and any equipment stationery etc. for the following: Register Debt and administer Order for Recovery, apply for Warrant and serve through certified Bailiff.			100000	Staff cost included in 2.1 Debt registration assumed 25% @ £5
	<b>Total</b>	25	702932	100000	
3.0	<b>IT Systems</b>				
3.1	All equipment, maintenance, licences etc. Any specific system support staff but not corporate IT support.	0		0	Included in 1.1
4.0	<b>Management and Performance Reporting</b>				
4.1	Staff costs (including overheads)	0		0	Included in 2.1
	<b>Overall Totals</b>	25	782932	1950000	
	<b>Combined total</b>			2732932	

Summary costs/Volume 2007/08	Value £	Volume No.	Notes
PCN income	3829002		
Charge income			inc above
<b>Total income</b>	3829002		
<b>Published Operation Expenditure</b>	3729500		
<b>Surplus</b>	99502		
Number CEO PCN's		56426	
Number camera/CCTV PCN's		26865	
<b>Total PCN's issued</b>		83291	
<b>Recovery rate</b>	65%		

Other useful information	Quantity	Notes
Length of Highway on KM (Source 1)	778.10	Length including Motorways, Trunk & TLRN
Number CPZ's		
Number of ticket machines	114	
Number of car parks		

Level of satisfaction with service quality

Pleased with new contract and low cost

Source 1: Department for Transport Roads major roads database  
Road length by Authority 2007



APPENDIX B

Staff number                      Parking Enforcement Service Delivery Costs 2007/08

	Barnet	Brent	Camden	Enfield	Haringey	Hillingdon
	In-house	Contract	Contract	Contract	In-house	Contract
1. The enforcement operation for parking, Bus Lane and Moving traffic offences:(The IT system costs are separate)		Removals adjustment - £500,000	Improvement cost adjs £2.5m Removals - £1	Including IT costs and informal reps Removals adjustment - £500,000	Removals adjustment - £780,000	Including IT costs
Staff number	88	0	24	0	97	0
At average cost £35,000	£3,080,000	£0	£840,000	£0	£3,395,000	£0
Other costs	£401,170	£2,810,200	£8,400,000	£3,228,000	£1,177,000	£1,850,000
Total	£3,481,258	£2,810,200	£9,240,024	£3,228,000	£4,572,097	£1,850,000
No of PCN's issued	156,825	113,658	565,000	104,000	198,238	83,291
PCN comparison per operational staff number	1,782		Contracted		2,044	
Length of road in Borough	791	493	288	662	363	778
Length of road per operational staff number	9.0		Contracted		3.7	
Total operations cost comparison per PCN	£22	£25	£16	£31	£23	£22
Total operations cost comparison per Km	£4,402	£5,704	£32,139	£4,875	£12,592	£2,378
2. Process and Debt recovery.		Including management costs		Including management costs		Including management costs
Staff number	26	15	52	28	26	25
At average cost £60,000	£1,560,000	£900,000	£3,090,000	£1,680,000	£1,560,000	£1,500,000
Other costs	£280,450	£142,000	£430,000	£239,000	£236,285	£100,000
Total	£1,840,476	£1,042,015	£3,520,052	£1,919,028	£1,796,311	£1,600,025
PCN comparison per process staff number	6,032	7,577	10,971	3,714	7,625	3,332
Total process cost comparison per PCN	£12	£9	£6	£18	£9	£19
3. IT Systems						
Staff number	1	0	0	0	0	0
At average cost £80,000	£80,000	£0	£0	£0	£0	£0
Other costs	£226,810	£600,000	£5,000,000	£0	£1,165,000	£0
Total	£306,811	£600,000	£5,000,000	£0	£1,165,000	£0
Total IT plus operational cost comparison per PCN	£24	£30	£25	£31	£29	£22
Total IT plus operational cost per Km	£4,790	£6,921	£49,531	£4,875	£15,800	£2,378
4. Management and Performance Reporting		Enhanced 3 @ £30000		Enhanced 5 @ £30000		Enhanced 5 @ £30000
Staff number	4	0	6	0	5	0
At average cost £90,000	£360,000	£90,000	£540,000	£150,000	£405,000	£150,000
Other costs	£0	£0	£600,000	£0	£0	£0
Total	£360,004	£90,000	£1,140,006	£150,000	£405,005	£150,000
Total Management plus process cost comparison per PCN	£14	£10	£8	£20	£11	£21
Total Management plus process cost per Km	£2,783	£2,298	£16,209	£3,124	£6,063	£2,249
Overall Total	£5,988,549	£4,542,215	£18,900,082	£5,297,028	£7,938,413	£3,600,025
Total enforcement cost comparison per PCN	£38	£40	£33	£51	£40	£43
Total enforcement cost comparison per Km	£7,573	£9,219	£65,739	£7,999	£21,863	£4,627
Totals from actual comparison	£5,469,560	£4,574,600	£19,767,616	£5,015,000	£7,907,285	£3,532,932
Debt, removals, improvements adjustment	£350,000	£1,100,000	£3,500,000	£1,378,000	£780,000	£200,000
Adjusted total based on staff no.	£6,338,549	£5,642,215	£22,400,082	£6,675,028	£8,718,413	£3,800,025
Published Expenditure	£5,850,879	£5,700,000	£23,308,000	£6,361,681	£8,681,000	£3,729,500

## APPENDIX C

Local Authority	Appeals received	Stat Decs received	Total completed	Appeals allowed	Of which not contested	Appeals refused	Of which withdrawn	%age Refused inc DNC
Enfield	676	183	755	235	30	520	8	69%
Greenwich	427	4	412	149	24	263	4	64%
Kingston Upon Thames	297	94	341	126	23	215	2	63%
Hammersmith & Fulham	1451	303	1345	550	262	795	10	59%
Sutton	143	25	123	51	17	72	0	59%
Wandsworth	1105	274	1255	544	266	711	11	57%
Transport for London	3283	938	5521	2427	1375	3094	1670	56%
Hillingdon	205	43	174	82	45	92	0	53%
Brent	746	239	816	392	164	424	3	52%
Richmond Upon Thames	974	159	973	480	193	493	15	51%
Lewisham	518	6	359	183	44	176	6	49%
Kensington and Chelsea	1868	418	1941	991	323	950	8	49%
Croydon	1046	184	1067	545	288	522	17	49%
Redbridge	837	115	743	401	178	342	2	46%
Bexley	1028	268	981	539	134	442	5	45%
Barnet	1454	318	1581	876	302	705	12	45%
Bromley	1133	111	1082	615	292	467	14	43%
Havering	555	147	631	365	208	266	0	42%
Merton	467	78	482	281	69	201	4	42%
Ealing	2830	528	3297	1928	917	1369	28	42%
Camden	4719	592	4653	2827	737	1826	80	39%
Newham	2408	309	2317	1499	800	818	4	35%
Tower Hamlets	1348	34	1329	862	374	467	10	35%
Waltham Forest	870	251	866	563	186	303	3	35%
Hounslow	2079	233	1932	1280	617	652	17	34%
Hackney	1562	68	1155	778	455	377	4	33%
Haringey	2343	0	2141	1446	787	695	14	32%
Harrow	990	49	888	634	407	254	5	29%
Islington	1733	72	1675	1225	941	450	30	27%
Corporation of London	2745	5	3279	2408	1805	871	329	27%
Barking and Dagenham	823	0	800	592	209	208	1	26%
Southwark	1825	203	1806	1343	555	463	3	26%
Westminster	6428	1218	8710	6890	4990	1820	138	21%
Lambeth	5971	0	5572	4627	2404	945	35	17%